



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

Organisation  
des Nations Unies  
pour l'éducation,  
la science et la culture

# World Heritage

# 41 COM

WHC/17/41.COM/8B.Add.2.Rev

Paris, 4 July 2017

Original: English / French

## UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

### CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

#### WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Forty-first session

Krakow, Poland

2-12 July 2017

**Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Establishment of the World Heritage List  
and of the List of World Heritage in Danger**

**8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List**

#### SUMMARY

This Addendum 2 is divided into three sections:

- I. Examination of a nomination to be processed on an emergency basis
- II. Examination of a minor boundary modification of a cultural property already inscribed on the World Heritage List
- III. Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of a property inscribed at the 40th session (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and not adopted by the World Heritage Committee

#### Decisions required:

The Committee is requested to examine the Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraphs 153, 161 and 162 of the *Operational Guidelines*, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) properties which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) properties which it decides **not to inscribe** on the World Heritage List;
- (c) properties whose consideration is **referred**;
- (d) properties whose consideration is **deferred**.

In the presentation below, ICOMOS Recommendations are presented in the form of Draft Decisions and are extracted from WHC/17/41.COM/INF.8B1.Add.2 (ICOMOS).

property that includes Tel Rumeida, the three areas of the old Town, and other sites of religious associations in order to reflect the heritage values of Judaism, Christianity and Islam,

6. Decides...

## I. NOMINATION TO BE PROCESSED ON AN EMERGENCY BASIS

Property	<b>Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town</b>
Id. N°	<b>1565</b>
State Party	<b>Palestine</b>
Criteria proposed by State Party	<b>(ii)(iv)(vi)</b>

See document WHC/17/41.COM/INF.8B1.Add.2, page 1.

### **Draft Decision: 41 COM 8B.1**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/17/41.COM/8B.Add.2.Rev and WHC/17/41.COM/INF.8B1.Add.2,
2. Taking note that on 30 January 2017 the World Heritage Centre received a request by the Permanent Delegation of Palestine to process the nomination of Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town for inscription on the World Heritage List in compliance with the standard procedure and that by letter dated 9 March 2017 the Permanent Delegation of Palestine requested to process this nomination on an emergency basis,
3. Taking also note of the provisions under Paragraph 161 of the Operational Guidelines concerning nominations to be processed on an emergency basis, which are to “constitute an emergency situation for which an immediate decision by the Committee is necessary to ensure their safeguarding” and to “unquestionably justify Outstanding Universal Value”,
4. Acknowledging that in its evaluation report of the nomination, ICOMOS states that “In view of the lack of a Field Visit, ICOMOS has not been able to fully evaluate whether the property unquestionably justifies some criteria, conditions of authenticity and integrity and management requirements nor whether recent incidents have drastically increased the level of threats to a degree that the situation may be considered an emergency for which an immediate action by the World Heritage Committee is needed”,
5. Also acknowledging that in its evaluation report ICOMOS indicates that:
  - a) “The comparative analysis has not so far justified consideration of the property for the World Heritage List”,
  - b) The three criteria proposed (ii, iv and vi) have not so far been demonstrated or justified,
  - c) a strong potential for Outstanding Universal Value could be demonstrated for an enlarged

## II. EXAMINATION OF A MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATION OF A CULTURAL PROPERTY ALREADY INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

### A. CULTURAL PROPERTIES

*the World Heritage property located within the buffer zone and in the wider setting.*

#### A.1. ARAB STATES

Property	Site of Palmyra
ID No.	23 Bis
State Party	Syrian Arab Republic

See WHC/17/41.COM/INF.8B1.Add.2, page 12.

#### **Draft Decision: 41 COM 8B.51**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. Having examined Document WHC/17/41.COM/8B.Add.2 Rev,
2. Approves the proposed minor modification to the boundaries of the **Site of Palmyra, Syrian Arab Republic**, with the exception of the archaeological sites of Al Bazouriya palace, Al-Bakhra, Al-Sukkari Palace and Khan Hallabat (mentioned in Annex 2 of the minor boundary modification proposal);
3. Also approves the proposed buffer zone for the **Site of Palmyra, Syrian Arab Republic**;
4. To support the protection and management, recommends that the State Party take the following further actions pending the improvement in the situation of conflict that has affected this property:
  - a) Further developing clear and workable objectives (including permitted and prohibited uses) for the various zones that comprise the buffer zone,
  - b) Ensuring that the permitted and prohibited uses in the buffer zone clearly addresses the wide range of potential land uses that could impact on the archaeological materials, such as quarrying, energy infrastructure, water supply and drainage networks, and so on,
  - c) Further developing planning and policy measures for the Ayn Fayad areas (south west of the property) and the Aamiryat urban area (north of the White Zone) to ensure that future developments do not pose intrusive pressures on the inscribed property,
  - d) Developing the Management Plan for the entire property and its buffer zone,
  - e) Finalising and implementing the Ministerial Decree that sets out the strategic policy for protecting World Heritage and the revised Antiquities Law as soon as possible,
  - f) Continuing to improve the understanding and protection of the attributes associated with

### III. STATEMENT OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE OF A PROPERTY INSCRIBED AT THE 40th SESSION (ISTANBUL/UNESCO, 2016) AND NOT ADOPTED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

#### **Draft Decision: 41 COM 8B.52**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/17/41.COM/8B.Add.2 Rev,
2. Adopts the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value for the following World Heritage property inscribed at the 40th session of the World Heritage Committee (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016):
  - Chad, Ennedi Massif: Natural and Cultural Landscape.

Property	Ennedi Massif: Natural and Cultural Landscape
State Party	Chad
ID No.	1475
Dates of inscription	2016

#### **Brief synthesis**

The Ennedi Massif is located in north-east Chad, in the East and West Ennedi regions, on the southern fringes of the Sahara. The Ennedi Massif culminates at 1,450 m altitude at the summit of the Basso Peak, contrasting with the surrounding plains. The orography and geographical location account for the rainfall in the Ennedi, which is estimated between 50 and 150mm / year, depending on the exposure and location. One of the characteristics of the Ennedi Massif is the shift from a hyper-arid climate towards a semi-arid climate, within an area of only a few kilometres. Such climatic variations usually stretch over hundreds of kilometres.

The Ennedi Massif displays many testimonies of an eventful climatological past which had an important impact on the natural and cultural history of the region. The region experienced a wet period during the lower Holocene which lasted from 11,700 to 4,300 BP, after which the present Saharan climate settled in. The increase in rainfall enabled the establishment of a fauna and flora that did not previously exist in this region, as well as the evolution of a very particular human culture. Thanks to its singular topology and microclimate, a very large part of the human heritage has survived to the present day in the Ennedi Massif following the aridification of the climate, unlike the surroundings of the massif and the majority of the Sahara. Over time, water and wind erosion sculpted the Ennedi Plateau, cutting

deep canyons and valleys and creating spectacular landscapes with exceptional features of an extremely impressive aesthetic, including natural arches, rock pillars, peaks and cliffs.

On the rocky surfaces of its caves, canyons and shelters, thousands of images were painted and engraved, constituting one of the largest collections of rock art of the Sahara and characterized by a wide variety of themes and styles. The property includes several rock art sites that illustrate cultural evolution and the adaptation of lifestyles to changes in climatic conditions in this area. However, thirty other important sites, such as that of Niola Doa, are not included within the boundaries of the property. The rock art covers a long period of about 7,000 years. Remarkably, it is common in the Ennedi Massif to find paintings belonging to different periods in the same site.

Moreover, the Ennedi Massif is a unique ecosystem in the Sahara, which today contains some relict species that were prevalent in this area during the early phases of the Holocene, mainly in the gorges and gueltas. The most prominent example is the small population of crocodiles, estimated at about 10 individuals, which live in the Guelta d'Archei.

**Criterion (iii):** Past human presence is attested by thousands of rock art sites scattered throughout the site of the Ennedi Massif. This form of human expression extends over a period of some 7,000 years. Sixteen styles and three different periods have been identified: archaic (7,000 - 6,000 BP), bovidian (5,000 - 2,000 BP), and cameline (2,000 BP – present day). The works are varied and original in both their expression and their styles. The polychromy of the paintings and the finesse of the engravings attest to refined know-how. Most of the rock walls were painted or engraved when cattle and sheep farming was practised (after the 8th millennium BP). Some human representations, now inaccessible due to soil erosion, are probably even older. The majority of the rock art expressions describe the relationships between humans, wildlife and domestic animals, clothing, jewelry, armaments and habitat. The introduction of horses during the Iron Age and dromedaries 2,000 years BP maximum is attested by innumerable images of mounted horses and meharis in a flying gallop, representations that seem to exist only in the Ennedi. The riders exhibit a dynamic attitude and the mounting harnesses are rendered with many details. The drawings

highlight elements always popular in the Ennedi: ample clothing, pommel saddles, dromedary cantles, arm knives, which illustrate details of the way of life of past communities.

Numerous monumental tombs in an intact state are scattered throughout the eastern part of the property. Similarly, the region is rich in remains related to iron metallurgy.

**Criterion (vii):** The Ennedi Massif is one of the six major mountain ranges of the Sahara, the largest desert in the world. The morphological and colour contrasts between this relief and the surrounding desert plains confer an outstanding aesthetic value. The slow wind and water erosion of the sandstones and the granitic Precambrian base contributed to sculpt a spectacular landscape, consisting of deep valleys, rock walls, rocky labyrinths, arches, pitons, mushroom rock formations, and pinnacles. The quality, quantity and density of these forms in the Ennedi Massif is exceptional worldwide.

Among the most emblematic landscapes, the verdant wetlands of the gueltas contrast with the ochre and red rocks of the relief. Sheltering the last crocodiles of the region and allowing dromedaries to drink, the Guelta d'Archei is an exceptional site encased in imposing walls of red sandstone. 120 metres high and 77 metres wide, the Aloba arch is the second largest in the world.

**Criterion (ix):** The plateau is cut by deep valleys and canyons in which water accumulates and favours the development of vegetation. These canyons play a fundamental role in the ecosystem. The survival of fauna, flora and human beings depends heavily on water, present permanently or temporarily in wetlands called gueltas.

The relief of the Ennedi Massif allows the local coexistence of hyper-arid to semi-arid zones and generates wetter conditions than in the surrounding desert plains. This situation enabled the animal and plant species to survive in the massif after the installation of the current arid Saharan climate there 4,300 years ago. These relict species thus testify to the former climate and are far removed from their current distribution ranges in the subtropical and tropical zone. This presence has earned the Ennedi the status of a Garden of Eden in the Sahara. Amongst these species, the gueltas shelter for example the *Rauwolfia Caffra*, a tree that usually grows in tropical and equatorial Africa. An estimated population of 10 crocodiles is also present in the Guelta d'Archei, where water is present all year round. This relict species found itself isolated a few thousand years ago with the draining of the hydrographic network linking the Ennedi to the neighbouring regions.

Due to these characteristics and the significant presence of tropical species, the Ennedi has the greatest diversity of species (526 species)

in the Sahara mountain range. This massif, including the East Saharan montane xeric woodlands and the Sahelian *Acacia* savannah, shelters Saharan, Sahelian, subtropical and relict species and constitutes an island of exceptional biodiversity in this desert.

### **Integrity**

The property contains elements that illustrate the values proposed and the processes underlying the formation of the attributes concerned and that ensure the key ecological processes of the property. These attributes are scattered throughout the property, and are relatively intact. Although the area has been inhabited and used by man for millennia, its exceptional landscape remains intact. Thus, although some of the great fauna is extinct, with other species highly endangered due to poaching, the site still contains assemblages of species of relict flora and fauna.

The boundaries of the property and its buffer zone are defined in such a way as to contain all natural and cultural aspects and permit the preservation and subsistence of traditional activities, which justifies Criterion (ix). The property also contains exceptional sites of rock paintings and engravings of extraordinary quality and composition, but some thirty important rock art sites are not included within the boundaries of the property.

The integrity of the property cannot be considered complete until the whole of the Ennedi Massif is within the boundaries of the inscribed property, and notably all the rock art sites, including the famous Niola Doa site. The buffer zone should be expanded to include all natural and cultural aspects that enable the preservation of the attributes expressing the Outstanding Universal Value and the subsistence of traditional activities in the respect of Outstanding Universal Value.

The visual integrity of the site is still intact. Although human density and frequency in the Ennedi Massif are very low and indigenous populations are involved in the protection of the massif, increasing livestock pressure and the emergence of small-scale initiatives to develop irrigated agriculture could threaten that integrity in the future. The allocation of an oil extraction concession covering part of the massif is another important threat to the integrity of the property.

### **Authenticity**

The attributes of the property meet the conditions of authenticity, but this would be reinforced by the addition, within the property boundaries, of the northern part of the massif sheltering numerous archaeological rock art sites. Archaeological remains, particularly rock art, reflect human and cultural evolution during the Holocene period as they provide insight into the life, traditions and beliefs of the ancestors of the indigenous population. They

also testify to important interactions between humans and animals and the role attributed to them.

The virgin aspect of the Ennedi Massif, combined with its type of vegetation, forms an intact landscape and a visual environment that are probably very close to those of the time when the rock art was realized. At present, the site is used by the indigenous population for traditional activities. Tourism accounts for only a small number of visitors and therefore does not disturb the perception or understanding of this living landscape which is at the same time a relict landscape. The association of archaeological remains, the traditional way of life and the intact natural environment testifies to the authenticity of the place, also maintained thanks to the traditional system of resource management.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

The property is protected by a special decree on its protection (Decree 260 / PR / PM / MCDT / 2016) of 5 March 2016, which confers legal protection to the site as a "mixed protected site". The protection measures introduced by the decree include the exclusion of mining prospecting or exploitation, hunting and logging. Traditional uses are permitted, but are not specified. Other legal instruments that provide protection include Law No. 14 / PR / 2008 concerning forest, wildlife and fisheries resources, Law No. 14 / PR / 98 concerning the environment, and Law No. 14 / PR / 60 concerning the protection of monuments and natural sites and prehistoric and archaeological monuments and objects. The legal protection of the property must be reinforced by the establishment of a protection regime appropriate to its cultural and natural values.

Currently the management of the site is provided by the local communities and is still based on traditional forms of organization (chiefdoms). This management must be reinforced by the establishment of a solid administrative structure responsible for the protection of the site and endowed with human and financial resources. A form of combined protection must be achieved, integrating both traditional and institutional stewardship, which must continue to ensure the involvement of local populations and increase their awareness and participation in safeguarding and managing the property.

A rudimentary management plan is in place, but a detailed management plan with a timetable for implementing the relevant measures, a clear distribution of responsibilities and roles for coordination among all parties involved, should accompany and support the management of the property. The plan should propose appropriate management strategies, including a zoning plan to manage the impact of increasingly intensive traditional use (notably increasing

pressure from extensive livestock production). It should include measures and activities to further improve waste management, awareness-raising and training of the indigenous population, capacity building and the establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system. In addition, an intensification of the research activities carried out for almost twenty years by the University of Cologne, Germany, in collaboration with the Chad partners, should be included. Such research should focus on the development of cartographic, botanical and archaeological inventories and documentation, whilst a wildlife inventory is being developed. The Government of Chad is currently working on the implementation of these measures, which must be rapidly completed.

Isolated, remote, and mainly used for pastoralism, the Ennedi Massif is little affected by human activities. Nevertheless, intensification of agricultural and pastoral practices could put pressure on water and pasture resources, which are fundamental for the ecosystems. The increase in the population and the number of tourists could also have a negative impact on wood resources and the integrity of the property. Many species have disappeared with poaching (oryx, addax, dama gazelle, ostrich, lion) and this practice threatens the current species. Large-scale mining and petroleum activities are prohibited in the property. Nevertheless, although originally included in the property, the area north of the 17th parallel was excluded from the proposal in February 2016. Oil exploration permits were granted in this area, which contains essential attributes to justify the Outstanding Universal Value of the Ennedi Massif. This exploitation in the vicinity of the property could have negative consequences on its integrity.